## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN SOUTHERN DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,	*	
Plaintiff,	*	CIVIL ACTION NO.
v.	*	Honorable
A&M Properties, Inc.,	*	попотарте
Defendant.	*	

### CONSENT DECREE

WHEREAS, Plaintiff, the United States of America, on behalf of the United States Department of Housing and Urban Development ("HUD") and the United States Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA"), has filed a complaint alleging that A&M Properties, Inc. ("Defendant") violated Section 1018 of the Residential Lead-Based Paint Hazard Reduction Act of 1992 ("Section 1018"), 42 U.S.C. § 4852d; and

WHEREAS, Section 1018 and the implementing regulations, found at 24 C.F.R. Part 35, Subpart A, and 40 C.F.R. Part 745, Subpart F, require, among other things, that the owners and managing agents of residential properties subject to the law make certain disclosures and provide certain records concerning Lead-Based Paint and Lead-Based Paint Hazards to tenants when a new lease is entered into or, if the lease predates the effective date of Section 1018, at the first change to the terms of an existing lease, such as a rent increase; and

WHEREAS, Defendant owns and manages 2 residential properties in Michigan constructed prior to 1978 containing

approximately 5 units that are subject to this Consent Decree; and

WHEREAS, the United States alleges that Defendant failed to make certain disclosures required by Section 1018; and

WHEREAS, Defendant has had limited Lead-Based Paint inspections performed in each residential property in which it has an ownership or management interest that is subject to this Consent Decree; and

WHEREAS, Defendant has replaced windows and either abated or agreed to abate Lead-Based Paint Hazards in its residential properties that are subject to this Consent Decree; and

WHEREAS, the United States alleges it is entitled to seek injunctive relief in a judicial action, including, but not limited to, an order requiring Defendant to comply with Section 1018 prospectively, and an order requiring Defendant to abate Lead-Based Paint; and

WHEREAS, the United States alleges that Defendant is subject to administrative civil penalties by HUD and EPA for violations of Section 1018 of up to \$11,000 per violation; and

WHEREAS, the United States and Defendant agree that settlement of the claims of the United States without further litigation is in the public interest and that entry of this Consent Decree is an appropriate means of resolving this matter; and

WHEREAS, the Parties agree that settlement and entry of this Consent Decree does not constitute admission or

acknowledgment of liability or wrongdoing by Defendant, but is intended solely to settle all claims asserted by the United States against Defendant on the terms set forth herein;

NOW, THEREFORE, upon consent and agreement of the United States and Defendant, and the Court having considered the matter and been duly advised,

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED as follows:

### I. JURISDICTION AND VENUE

1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 and 1345 and 42 U.S.C. § 4852d(b)(2) and has personal jurisdiction over the Defendant. Defendant consents to, and shall not challenge entry of, this Consent Decree and the Court's jurisdiction to enter and enforce this Consent Decree.

2. Venue is proper in this Court pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 4852d(b)(2) and 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) and (c) because the lawsuit involves actions that took place, and 2 Subject Properties are located, in the Eastern District of Michigan.

### II. PARTIES BOUND

3. This Consent Decree shall apply to and be binding upon the United States and Defendant, and its successors and assigns.

4. Defendant shall remain liable to the United States for all the obligations set forth in this Consent Decree regardless if Defendant sells or transfers any property subject to this Consent Decree prior to termination of the Consent Decree.

#### III. <u>DEFINITIONS</u>

5. Unless otherwise expressly provided herein, terms used in this Consent Decree, which are defined in the Residential Lead-Based Paint Hazard Reduction Act ("Act"), shall have the meaning given in the Act or in any regulations promulgated pursuant to the Act. Whenever other terms listed below are used in this Consent Decree, the following definitions shall apply:

"Clearance Examination" shall mean an activity a. conducted after Lead-Based Paint hazard abatement activities, pursuant to Chapter 15 of the HUD Guidelines, have been performed that the Lead-Based Paint Hazard abatement to determine activities are complete and that no settled dust-lead hazards exist in the dwelling unit, soil, or worksite. The clearance process includes a visual assessment of all work areas and collection and analysis of environmental samples. The appropriate clearance standards shall be the more restrictive of those set by the jurisdiction where the property is located or by Section 403 of the Toxic Substances Control Act ("TSCA") and its implementing regulations, 40 C.F.R. Part 745.227(e)(8)-(9).

b. "Day" shall mean a calendar day. In computing any period of time under this Consent Decree, where the last day would fall on a Saturday, Sunday, or federal holiday, the period shall run until the close of business of the next working day.

c. A "force majeure event" shall mean any event beyond the control of Defendant, its contractors, or any entity controlled by Defendant that delays the performance of any obligation under this Consent Decree despite Defendant's best

efforts to fulfill the obligation. "Best efforts" includes anticipating any potential force majeure event and addressing the effects of any such event (a) as it is occurring and (b) after it has occurred, to prevent or minimize any resulting delay to the greatest extent possible. "Force majeure" does not include Defendant's financial inability to perform any obligation under this Consent Decree.

d. "Friction Surface" shall mean an interior or exterior surface that is subject to abrasion or friction, including, but not limited to, certain window, floor, and stair surfaces.

e. "HUD Guidelines" shall mean the edition of the "HUD Guidelines for the Evaluation and Control of Lead-Based Paint Hazards in Housing" in effect on the date the work is conducted pursuant to this Consent Decree.

f. "Impact Surface" shall mean an interior or exterior surface that is subject to damage by repeated sudden force, such as certain parts of door frames.

g. "Interest" shall mean interest pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1961.

h. "Lead-Based Paint" shall mean paint or other surface coatings that contain lead equal to or in excess of 1.0 milligram per square centimeter or 0.5 percent by weight. If housing subject to this Consent Decree is located in a jurisdiction with a more stringent definition of Lead-Based Paint or safety standard, "Lead-Based Paint", as used herein, shall

mean paint or other surface coatings that meet the more stringent standards.

i. "Lead-Based Paint Free" shall mean housing that has been found to be free of paint or other surface coatings that contain lead equal to or in excess of 1.0 milligram per square centimeter or 0.5 percent by weight. If housing subject to this Consent Decree is located in a jurisdiction with a more stringent definition of Lead-Based Paint or safety standard, "Lead-Based Paint Free", as used herein, shall mean housing that meets the more stringent standard.

j. "Lead-Based Paint Hazards" shall mean lead-based paint hazards as that term is defined in 40 CFR § 745.65.

k. "Lead Abatement Supervisor" shall mean any person licensed by the State in which the property is located to perform lead hazard abatement and mitigation, and supervise lead hazard abatement workers who perform lead hazard abatement and mitigation.

1. "Paragraph" shall mean a portion of this Consent Decree identified by an Arabic numeral or a lower case letter.

m. "Section" shall mean a portion of this Consent Decree identified by a roman numeral.

n. "Subject Properties" shall mean the properties listed on Appendix A, attached hereto.

o. "United States" shall mean the United States of America on behalf of HUD and EPA.

## IV. <u>COMPLIANCE WITH SECTION 1018</u>

6. Defendant shall comply with all requirements of Section 1018 and its implementing regulations.

7. To the extent not previously accomplished, no later than ten (10) days after entry of this Consent Decree, Defendant shall provide to each tenant in the Subject Properties a lead hazard information pamphlet approved by EPA, as well as a "lead paint disclosure form" which shall include at a minimum the following:

a. Any known information concerning Lead-Based Paint Hazards and/or Lead-Based Paint;

b. Any available records or reports, or summaries thereof, pertaining to Lead-Based Paint Hazards and/or Lead-Based Paint in the Subject Properties;

c. A Lead Warning Statement containing the specific language set forth in regulations promulgated pursuant to Section 1018; and

d. Signatures and dates of both the Defendant and tenant(s).

8. Within twenty (20) days after entry of this Consent Decree, Defendant shall provide written notice to HUD and EPA that it has complied with the requirements of Paragraph 7 of this Consent Decree.

#### V. <u>PAYMENT OF PENALTY</u>

9. Within thirty (30) days after entry of this Consent Decree, Defendant shall pay a civil penalty of \$42,500 to the United States as an administrative penalty for past violations of Section 1018.

10. Payment of the civil penalty shall be rendered by electronic funds transfer to the United States Department of Justice, in accordance with current procedures, referencing USAO File Number 2004V00906 and the civil action case name and case number of the Eastern District of Michigan. Payment shall be made in accordance with instructions provided to Defendant by the Financial Litigation Unit of the U.S. Attorney's Office for the Eastern District of Michigan. Any funds received after 5:00 p.m. (EDT) shall be credited on the next business day.

11. Notification that payment of the civil penalty has been made, referencing the USAO File Number 2004V00906 and the civil action case name and case number of the Eastern District of Michigan, shall be provided in accordance with the notification provisions of Section XVI.

12. If Defendant fails to make any payment under Paragraph 9, Defendant shall be subject to Stipulated Penalties pursuant to Paragraph 22 of this Consent Decree. In addition, Interest shall accrue on any unpaid amounts until the total amount due has been received.

13. Defendant shall not deduct the civil penalty paid to the United States, or any Interest or Stipulated Penalties, paid under this Consent Decree from its federal, state, or local income taxes, and the United States does not in any way release Defendant from any claims arising under Title 26 of the United States Code.

#### VI. WORK TO BE PERFORMED

14. This Section shall govern the Lead-Based Paint Hazard Abatement work and ongoing operations and maintenance ("O&M") work to be performed under this Consent Decree at all Subject Properties.

15.a. Prior to entry, but as part of this settlement, Defendant had limited Lead-Based Paint inspections performed in each Subject Property. Defendant provided a copy of each limited Lead-Based Paint inspection report to HUD.

b. Also prior to entry, but as part of this settlement, Defendant provided to HUD a plan for Lead-Based Paint Hazard Abatement work performed at the Subject Properties. After review of the Hazard Abatement Plan, HUD has approved the submission.

c. No later than thirty (30) days after entry of this Consent Decree, Defendant shall submit a plan to HUD and EPA for ongoing operations and maintenance ("O&M Plan") for those properties that are not Lead-Based Paint Free. The O&M Plan

shall include provisions to perform visual assessments of units, common areas, and exteriors on a regular basis in accordance with Chapter 6 of the HUD Guidelines, and upon tenant turnover. After review of the O&M Plan, HUD shall, in writing: (1) approve, in whole or in part, the submission; (2) approve the submission with modifications; or (3) disapprove, in whole or in part, the submission, directing the Defendant to resubmit the document after modification to address HUD's comments. If HUD disapproves of or requires revisions to the O&M Plan, in whole or in part, Defendant shall amend and resubmit to HUD a revised O&M Plan which is responsive to the directions in HUD's comments, within fifteen (15) days of receiving such comments. If the O&M Plan, as revised by Defendant, is still not acceptable to HUD, HUD shall revise the O&M Plan itself and Defendant shall implement this Plan as revised by HUD, subject to Defendant's right to dispute resolution. The O&M Plan shall be prepared in accordance with Chapters 6 and 17 of the HUD Guidelines.

16. For each Subject Property, the following work has either been completed prior to entry as part of this settlement or shall be performed:

a. Defendant has replaced all painted windows and associated components in accordance with the Hazard Abatement Plan and Chapter 12 of the HUD Guidelines.

b. Defendant has completed Lead-Based Paint Hazard Abatement of all painted interior Friction and Impact Surfaces and associated components unless that particular component has been found to be Lead-Based Paint Free, EXCEPT for stair treads. Defendant shall enclose all stair treads with rubber in accordance with the Hazard Abatement Plan and Chapter 12 of the HUD Guidelines.

c. Defendant has stabilized all deteriorated interior walls, ceilings, and other surfaces not considered Friction and/or Impact surfaces in accordance with Chapter 11 of the HUD Guidelines unless that particular component was found to be Lead-Based Paint Free.

d. The remaining Lead-Based Paint Hazard Abatement work of the units, common areas, and exteriors of each Subject Property, specifically enclosure of stair treads with rubber, listed above in Paragraphs 16.b. shall be completed within two (2) months after entry of the Consent Decree.

e. Defendant has covered bare soil identified on the grounds of each Subject Property with a vegetative ground covering, mulch, or other appropriate covering in accordance with Chapter 11 of the HUD Guidelines.

f. For the additional work required under Paragraph 16.b., worksite preparation and occupant protection shall be in accordance with Chapter 8 of the HUD Guidelines.

g. For the additional work required under Paragraph 16.b., daily and final cleanups shall be in accordance with Chapter 14 of the HUD Guidelines.

h. Defendant had Clearance Examinations conducted by a certified Lead-Based Paint risk assessor in each Subject Property upon completion of final cleanup in accordance with Chapter 15 of the HUD Guidelines, TSCA Section 403, 15 U.S.C. § 2683, and 40 CFR 745.227(e)(8) and (9) and those clearance examination reports have been submitted to HUD.

17. Ongoing O&M in all Subject Properties that are not certified Lead-Based Paint Free shall be implemented within thirty (30) days of completion of the remaining Lead-Based Paint Hazard Abatement work in Paragraph 16.b. above and shall be in accordance with the O&M Plan and Chapters 6 and 17 of the HUD Guidelines. During reevaluations, Defendant shall ensure that all components and/or surfaces treated are still intact and the Lead-Based Paint Hazard Abatement and paint stabilization work has not failed. If any Lead-Based Paint Hazard Abatement or paint stabilization work has failed, Defendant shall repair the area in accordance with Chapters 11, 12 and/or 13 of the HUD Guidelines, as applicable, and perform a Clearance Examination within thirty (30) days of discovery. If dust hazards are discovered as part of ongoing reevaluations, Defendant shall address them according to Chapter 11 of the HUD Guidelines. Ongoing O&M must be

performed in all Subject Properties in accordance with the O&M Plan and Chapters 6 and 17 of the HUD Guidelines for at least 6 months after completion of the remaining Lead-Based Paint Hazard Abatement work required in Paragraph 16.b. before Defendant can petition for termination of the Consent Decree under Paragraph 55, below.

#### VII. QUALIFICATIONS TO CONDUCT LEAD-BASED PAINT WORK

18. All Lead-Based Paint window replacement, Hazard Abatement work, and other Lead-Based Paint work was and shall continue to be consistent with the HUD Guidelines and conducted by individuals authorized to perform the work in accordance with the laws of the jurisdiction where the property is located. Persons performing interim controls, visual assessments for O&M, and general maintenance shall be trained in either HUD's one day "Lead Safe Work Practices" class or the HUD/EPA "Remodeling, Repair, and Painting" class.

19. Defendant shall ensure that Clearance Examinations are not conducted by the same individual and/or same or affiliated business entity conducting the Lead-Based Paint window replacement and/or Hazard Abatement work that is being evaluated by the Clearance Examination.

20. Defendant shall ensure that the window replacement and/or Hazard Abatement work is not done by the same individual

and/or same or affiliated business entity that performed the Lead-Based Paint testing at the Subject Properties.

#### VIII. REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

21.a. On or before the one (1) year anniversary of the entry of this Consent Decree, and after completion of all Lead-Based Paint window replacement, Lead-Based paint Hazard Abatement work, including stair treads, and the required six (6) months of ongoing O&M at the Subject Properties, Defendant shall submit a written Report to HUD and EPA. The Report shall include, at a minimum: (1) the status of the Lead-Based Paint Hazard Abatement work required under Paragraph 16.b.; (2) the status of ongoing O&M activities in accordance with Paragraph 17; (3) any and all information concerning the cost of window replacement and Hazard Abatement work performed; (4) any Clearance Reports that have not been previously provided to HUD under Paragraph 16.h.; and (5) any State, County or City notices relating to Lead-Based Paint violations at the Subject Properties.

b. Defendant shall ensure contractor compliance with any State, County and/or City requirements for reporting Lead-Based Paint window replacement and Hazard Abatement work in accordance with the laws of the jurisdiction where the property is located.

## IX. <u>STIPULATED PENALTIES</u>

22. If Defendant fails to make timely payment of the penalty provided for in Section V, Defendant shall be required to pay as Stipulated Penalties \$400 per day. Stipulated Penalties shall accrue until such time as the original penalty and all accrued Stipulated Penalties are paid.

23. If Defendant fails to complete the Lead-Based Paint Hazard Abatement work as described in Paragraph 16.b., or to conduct O&M as described in Paragraph 17, Defendant shall pay Stipulated Penalties of \$400 per day per violation per each unit, until the Lead-Based Paint Hazard Abatement work, and/or O&M is completed. If any Lead-Based Paint Hazard Abatement or paint stabilization work fails because of Defendant's failure to follow the Lead-Based Paint Hazard Abatement Plan or HUD Guidelines and/or conduct O&M as described in Paragraph 17, those properties shall not be considered abated in accordance with this Consent Decree and Stipulated Penalties shall accrue.

24. If Defendant fails to submit any information or reports to HUD, as described in Paragraphs 15, 16, and 21 in accordance with the requirements and/or deadlines set forth in this Consent Decree, Defendant shall pay Stipulated Penalties of \$200 per day for each day each such submission is deemed inadequate and/or late.

25. Payment of Stipulated Penalties shall be made to the United States in the manner set forth in Paragraph 10 of this Consent Decree.

Stipulated Penalties shall accrue regardless of 26. whether the United States has notified Defendant of the violation or made a demand for payment, but need only be paid upon demand. All penalties shall begin to accrue on the day after payment or the required activity is due and shall continue to accrue through the date of payment, or until the required activity is performed. However, the United States may, in its unreviewable discretion, waive or reduce the amount of any Stipulated Penalty. Nothing herein shall prevent the United States from seeking other relief that may be available for non-compliance, nor prevent the separate penalties for separate accrual of simultaneous violations of this Consent Decree.

#### X. FORCE MAJEURE

27. Defendant shall provide notice orally or by electronic or facsimile transmission to the Civil Division Chief of the United States Attorney's Office as detailed in Section XVI of this Consent Decree (Notice) as soon as possible, but not later than 72 hours after the time Defendant first knew of, or by the exercise of due diligence, should have known of, a claimed force majeure event. Defendant shall also provide formal, written notice, as provided in Section XVI of this Consent Decree

(Notice), within seven (7) days of the time Defendant first knew of, or by the exercise of due diligence, should have known of, the event. The notice shall state the anticipated duration of any delay; its cause(s); Defendant's past and proposed actions to prevent or minimize any delay; a schedule for carrying out those actions; and Defendant's rationale for attributing any delay to a force majeure event. Failure to provide oral and written notice as required by this Paragraph shall preclude Defendant from asserting any claim of force majeure.

28. If the United States agrees that a force majeure event has occurred, the United States may agree to extend the time for Defendant to perform the affected requirements for the time necessary to complete those obligations. An extension of time to perform the obligations affected by a force majeure event shall not, by itself, extend the time to perform any other obligation. Where the United States agrees to an extension of time, the appropriate modification shall be made pursuant to Section XVIII of this Consent Decree (Integration).

29. If the United States does not agree that a force majeure event has occurred, or does not agree to the extension of time sought by Defendant, the United States' position shall be binding, unless Defendant invokes Dispute Resolution under Section XI of this Consent Decree. In any dispute involving force majeure, Defendant bears the burden of proving, by a

preponderance of the evidence, that each claimed force majeure event is in fact a force majeure event; that Defendant gave the notice required by Paragraph 27 of this Section; that the force majeure event caused any delay Defendant claims was attributable to that event; and that Defendant exercised best efforts to prevent or minimize any delay caused by the event.

#### XI. <u>DISPUTE RESOLUTION</u>

30. Unless otherwise expressly provided for in this Consent Decree, the dispute resolution procedures of this Section shall be the exclusive mechanism to resolve disputes arising under or with respect to this Consent Decree. However, the procedures set forth in this Section shall not apply to actions by the United States to enforce the obligations of Defendant under this Consent Decree that Defendant has not timely disputed in accordance with this Section.

31. Any dispute which arises under or with respect to this Consent Decree shall in the first instance be the subject of informal negotiations between the Parties. The period for informal negotiations shall not exceed thirty (30) days from the time the dispute arises, unless it is modified by written agreement of the Parties. The dispute shall be considered to have arisen when one Party sends the other Party a written Notice of Dispute.

If the Parties are not in agreement at the end of 32. this informal negotiations period, the position of the United States shall be controlling unless Defendant files a petition with the Court for resolution of the dispute within twenty-one (21) days of receipt of the United States' final position. The petition shall set out the nature of the dispute with a proposal for its resolution. The United States shall have twenty-one (21) file a response with an alternate proposal days to for resolution. In any such dispute, Defendant shall have the burden of proving that the United States' proposal is arbitrary and capricious.

33. The invocation of formal dispute resolution procedures under this Section shall not extend, postpone or affect any obligation of Defendant under this Consent Decree not directly in dispute, unless the United States or the Court agrees Stipulated Penalties with respect to the disputed otherwise. matter shall continue to accrue but payment shall be stayed pending resolution of the dispute as provided in Paragraph 26. Notwithstanding the stay of payment, Stipulated Penalties shall accrue from the first day of non-compliance with any applicable provision of this Consent Decree. In the event that the Defendant does not prevail on the disputed issue, Stipulated Penalties shall be assessed and paid as provided in Paragraph 26.

#### XII. <u>RIGHT OF ENTRY</u>

34. HUD, EPA and their representatives, contractors, consultants, and attorneys shall have the right of entry into and upon offices of Defendant where lead disclosure forms and/or Lead-Based paint records or reports are kept, and all Subject Properties owned or controlled by Defendant, at all reasonable times, upon proper presentation of credentials, for the purposes of:

a. monitoring the progress of activities required by this Consent Decree;

b. verifying any data or information required to be submitted pursuant to this Consent Decree;

c. obtaining samples and, upon request, splits of any samples taken by Defendant or its consultants (upon request, Defendant will be provided with splits of all samples taken by the United States); and

d. otherwise assessing Defendant's compliance with this Consent Decree.

35. This Section in no way limits or affects any right of entry and inspection held by the United States, HUD, EPA, and any State, County, or City in which the property is located pursuant to applicable federal, state or local laws, regulations, or permits.

#### XIII. COVENANT NOT TO SUE

36. In consideration of the payments required by this Consent Decree and the work to be performed, and except as otherwise provided in this Consent Decree, the United States covenants not to sue or take administrative or other action against Defendant arising out of violations of Section 1018 at the Subject Properties that occurred on or before the date of lodging of this Consent Decree. This covenant not to sue with respect to Defendant is conditioned upon the complete and satisfactory performance by Defendant of its obligations under this Consent Decree. This covenant not to sue extends only to Defendant and does not extend to any other person or business entity.

## XIV. PLAINTIFFS' RESERVATIONS OF RIGHTS

37. The covenant not to sue set forth above does not pertain to any matters other than those expressly specified in Paragraph 36. The United States reserves, and this Consent Decree is without prejudice to, all rights against Defendant with respect to all other matters, including but not limited to, the following:

a. claims based on a failure by Defendant to meet a requirement of this Consent Decree;

b. claims based upon violations of Section 1018 that occur after the date of lodging of this Consent Decree;

c. criminal liability; and

d. all claims not barred by Paragraph 36 of this Consent Decree.

#### XV. MISCELLANEOUS

38. This Consent Decree in no way affects Defendant's responsibilities to comply with all federal, state, or local laws and regulations.

39. Except as otherwise provided in this Consent Decree, each Party shall bear its own costs and attorneys' fees in this action.

## XVI. NOTICES AND SUBMISSIONS

40. Whenever, under the terms of this Consent Decree, notice is required to be given or a document is required to be sent by one Party to another, it shall be in writing and directed to the individuals at the addresses specified below, unless those individuals or their successors give notice of a change to the other Party in writing. Written notice as specified herein shall constitute complete satisfaction of any written notice requirement of this Consent Decree with respect to the United States and Defendant.

41. All notices and reports shall refer to this Consent Decree and the date of entry of the Consent Decree, and shall cite the case name of <u>United States v. A&M Properties, Inc.</u> and the case number.

## U.S. Attorney's Office:

Chief, Civil Division United States Attorney's Office U.S. Department of Justice 211 West Fort Street, Suite 2001 Detroit, Michigan 48226 (313) 226-9782 (phone) (313) 226-3271 (fax) Elizabeth.Larin@usdoj.gov

### U.S. Department of Justice:

Chief, Environmental Enforcement Section U.S. Department of Justice P.O. Box 7611 Ben Franklin Station Washington, DC 20044 D.J. Ref. 90-5-2-1-08345

U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development:

Director, Compliance Assistance and Enforcement Division Office of Healthy Homes and Lead Hazard

Control U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development 451 7th Street, SW Room 8236 Washington, DC 20410

#### and

John B. Shumway, Deputy Assistant

General Counsel Office of General Counsel U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development 451 7th Street, SW Room 9253 Washington, DC 20410 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency:

Chief, Pesticides and Toxics Compliance Section U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Region 5 77 West Jackson Boulevard Chicago, IL 60604

Defendant:

Martin Siersma, President A&M Properties, Inc. P.O. Box 243 Eastpointe, MI 48021

42. Any Party may change either the notice recipient or the address for providing notices to it by serving all other Parties with a notice setting forth such new notice recipient or address.

43. Any notice, report, certification, data presentation, or other document submitted by Defendant pursuant to this Consent Decree which discusses, describes, demonstrates, supports any findings, or makes any representation concerning Defendant's compliance or non-compliance with any requirement of this Consent Decree shall be certified by Defendant or a duly authorized representative of Defendant. A person is a "duly authorized representative" only if: (a) the authorization is made in writing; (b) the authorization specifies either an individual or position having responsibility for overall operation of the regulated facility or activity (a duly

authorized representative may thus be either a named individual or any individual occupying a named position); and (c) the written authorization is submitted to the United States consistent with this Paragraph.

44. The certification required by Paragraph 43, above, shall be in the following form:

I certify that the information contained in or accompanying this [type of submission] is true, accurate and complete. With regard to [the/those identified portion(s)] of this [type of submission] for which I cannot personally verify [its/their] accuracy, I certify under penalty of law that this [type of submission] and all attachments were prepared in accordance with procedures designed to assure that qualified personnel properly gather and evaluate the information submitted. Based on my inquiry of the person or persons who manage the system, or those persons directly responsible for gathering the information, or the immediate supervisor of such persons, the information submitted is, the best of my knowledge and belief, true, accurate and complete. I am aware that there are significant penalties for submitting false information,

including the possibility of fines and imprisonment for knowing violations.

Signature:		
Name:		
Title:	·	

## XVII. <u>RETENTION OF JURISDICTION</u>

45. This Court shall retain jurisdiction over this matter for the purpose of interpreting and enforcing the terms of this Consent Decree.

#### XVIII. <u>INTEGRATION</u>

46. This Consent Decree and its Appendix constitute the final, complete and exclusive agreement and understanding between the Parties with respect to the settlement embodied in this Consent Decree. It may not be enlarged, modified, or altered unless such modifications are made in writing and approved by the Parties and the Court. The Parties acknowledge that there are no representations, agreements or understandings relating to the settlement other than those expressly contained in this Consent Decree.

## XIX. LODGING AND OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT

47. Defendant agrees and acknowledges that final approval of this Consent Decree by the United States and entry of

this Consent Decree are subject to the requirements of 28 C.F.R. § 50.7, which provides for notice of the lodging of this Consent Decree in the Federal Register, opportunity for public comment for at least thirty (30) days, and consideration of any comments prior to entry of the Consent Decree by the Court. The United States reserves its right to withdraw consent to this Consent Decree based on comments received during the public notice period. Defendant consents to entry of this Consent Decree without further notice to the Court.

48. If for any reason the Court should decline to approve this Consent Decree in the form presented, this Consent Decree is voidable at the discretion of any Party and the terms of the Consent Decree may not be used as evidence in any litigation between the Parties.

#### XX. EFFECTIVE DATE

49. The effective date of this Consent Decree shall be the date upon which it is entered by the Court.

### XXI. RECORD RETENTION AND PRESERVATION

50. Defendant shall preserve, during the pendency of this Consent Decree and for a minimum of at least twelve (12) months after its termination, all documents and records in its custody, control or possession and in the custody, control or possession of its employees, agents, assigns, contractors, subcontractors or consultants, which in any manner relate to this

Consent Decree or to the performance of work under this Consent Decree. At the end of this twelve (12) month period and at least thirty (30) calendar days before any document or record is destroyed, Defendant shall notify and make available to the United States such documents and records, or shall provide the originals or accurate, true and complete copies of such documents and records to the United States. Defendant shall not destroy any document or record to which the United States has requested access for inspection or copying until the United States has obtained such access or copies or withdrawn its request for such access or copies.

#### XXII.SIGNATORIES/SERVICE

51. Each undersigned representative of the United States and Defendant certifies that he or she has reviewed this Consent Decree, and had the opportunity to have this Consent Decree reviewed by counsel, and is authorized to enter into the terms and conditions of this Consent Decree and to execute and bind legally such Party to this document.

52. Defendant hereby agrees not to oppose entry of this Consent Decree by this Court or to challenge any provision of this Consent Decree, unless the United States has notified Defendant in writing that it no longer supports entry of the Consent Decree based on public comments received pursuant to Paragraph 47 above.

53. Defendant agrees that the person identified on its behalf under Section XVI is authorized to accept service of process by mail on behalf of Defendant with respect to all matters arising under or relating to this Consent Decree. Defendant hereby agrees to accept service by certified mail in that manner and to waive the formal service requirements set forth in Rule 4 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and any applicable local rules of this Court, including but not limited to, service of a summons.

54. Upon approval and entry of this Consent Decree by the Court, the Consent Decree shall constitute a final judgment pursuant to Rules 54 and 58 of the Federal Rule of Civil Procedure.

## XXIII. TERMINATION

55. This Consent Decree shall terminate after all of the following have occurred:

a.Defendant has completed all work required by this Consent Decree;

b. Defendant has paid all penalties and interest due under this Consent Decree and no penalties are outstanding or owed to the United States;

c. Defendant has certified compliance with the terms and conditions of this Consent Decree to the United States; and

d. The United States has not disputed Defendant's certification. If the United States disputes Defendant's certification, the Consent Decree shall remain in effect pending resolution of the dispute by the Parties or the Court. If the United States does not contest the certification, the United States shall petition or the Parties shall jointly petition the Court to terminate the Consent Decree.

So entered in accordance with the foregoing this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2008.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

THE UNDERSIGNED PARTIES enter into this Consent Decree in the above matter, relating to the sites enumerated in this Consent Decree:

FOR PLAINTIFF, UNITED STATES OF AMERICA:

RONALD J. TENPAS Assistant Attorney General Environment and Natural Resources Division

Date 1/23/08

W. BENJAMIN FISHEROW Deputy Chief Environmental Enforcement Section Environment and Natural Resources Division U.S. Department of Justice 950 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20530

STEPHEN J. MURPHY United States Attorney

ELIZABETH LARIN Civil Division Chief

Date\_

CAROLYN BELL HARBIN Assistant U.S. Attorney Eastern District of Michigan 211 West Fort Street, Suite 2001 Detroit, Michigan 48226 (313) 226-9114 <u>Carolyn.Bell-Harbin@usdoj.gov</u> (P27350)

FOR UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT:

Date\_\_\_\_\_

JOHN P. OPITZ Associate General Counsel for the Office of Finance and Regulatory Compliance

Date

JOHN B. SHUMWAY Deputy Assistant General Counsel for Program Compliance U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development 451 Seventh Street, SW Washington, DC 20410 (202) 708-4184 ext. 5190

FOR THE UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY:

Date

ROBERT A. KAPLAN Regional Counsel U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Region 5 77 West Jackson Boulevard Chicago, IL 60604 (312) 886-1308

Date\_\_\_\_\_

MARY T. McAULIFFE Associate Regional Counsel U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Region 5 77 West Jackson Boulevard Chicago, IL 60604 (312) 886-6237

FOR A&M PROPERTIES, INC.:

MARTIN SIERSMA, President A&M Properties, Inc. P.O. Box 243 Eastpointe, MI 48021 Date\_\_\_\_

## <u>APPENDIX A</u> (Subject Properties with Street Addresses and State, <u>Number of Units</u> <u>and Construction Date)</u>

	Subject Property	Number of Units	Construction Date
1.	438 Newport, Detroit MI	1 unit	1924
2.	3176-3178 Canton, Detroit MI	4 units	1913